

Chapter 11. Non-state TVET Providers¹

This chapter sets out the role of non-state TVET providers in TVET. We note that, in addition to public TVET authorities, countries in SSA generally have non-state-controlled and private TVET providers. Such providers often already have – or seek – a degree of influence on the national TVET system. In this chapter, we examine how far this influence goes and how it is being utilised (RQ19.c–f, private education providers, companies, unions). We also take the perspective of businesses to look at their role in the provision of TVET.

Research questions considered in this chapter

The research questions considered in this chapter are listed in the box below.

Research questions considered in this chapter

RQ8. Participation and role of industry and commerce (engagement / relationship of the TVET system in business / industry / commerce).

RQ19. Actor analysis: **Stakeholders in TVET policy** and education system decision making.

[RQ19.c] Is everything in state hands, or, if not, what relevance do **private education providers** have in the system?

[RQ19.d] Do **businesses** play a role in TVET and do they influence TVET policy (participation, consultation, design)?

[RQ19.e] Do **trade unions** play a role?

[RQ19.f] Is there an extended, relevant system of (merchants' / artisans') **guilds**? Does it play a role regarding TVET?

We note that other parts of RQ19 are covered in Chapters 10 and 13.

¹ Citation for this chapter: Haßler, Haseloff, et al. (2020). *Chapter 11. Non-state TVET Providers*. In: Haßler, Haseloff, et al. (2020). *Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Systematic Review of the Research Landscape*. VET Repository, Bundesinstitut für Berufsbildung, Bonn, Germany. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3843362>

Conclusions of this chapter

There is also evidence – in some cases quite sparse – of non-governmental TVET activities in Ethiopia, Ghana, Kenya, Nigeria, Uganda, South Africa and Tanzania. The non-governmental sector comprises private TVET providers (including large international companies), nonprofit organisations, voluntary organisations and NGOs. Across SSA, these actors have varying degrees of involvement in formulating policy, developing curricula, determining priorities for occupational standards, forecasting future labour demand, and setting indicators for curricula and for the quality of work-based education.

This prevalence of private education providers can be seen, for example, in Nigeria. There, private providers offer a real alternative to state providers in services such as education for teachers and curriculum development. In both Kenya and Botswana, state efforts are made to involve private TVET providers and industry in the design of TVET. In other countries, such as Ghana (and South Africa with its SETAs), the industrial or commercial sector is involved not only in the provision of TVET, but also in the development of government guidelines or training plans for TVET through participation in the TVET Authority (i.e. COTVET, in Ghana) and its advisory committees.

It is important to note that data on private TVET providers are inconsistent throughout our dataset. In particular, we did not come across research on the role of the industry as a promoter and beneficiary of TVET.

Responses from interviewees from the Structured Community Review (SCR) point to examples of collaboration between governmental TVET institutions and industry, which are present at least partially in some countries in SSA (Ghana, Ethiopia, South Africa, Madagascar, Zambia, Kenya, Namibia, Tanzania, Cameroon). The participants agree that a partnership between the two sides would be beneficial for all those involved in TVET.

As with the other chapters, the subsequent sections offer additional details of the points discussed in the summary above.

11.1. The prevalence of private education providers

The data obtained on private TVET providers are not consistent throughout our dataset. In Kenya and Nigeria, accessing the information on the number of private institutions was relatively straightforward. In some countries, such as Ethiopia, we were only able to obtain data on the number of graduates from private and public institutions combined. In other cases, we were able to compile only a fraction of the figures necessary to form a comprehensive picture. According to the African Union's Skills Portal for Youth Employment and Entrepreneurship (ASPYEE):

“The private sector plays an important role in skills development. It comprises of large corporations, for-profit institutions, voluntary organisations and NGOs. The engagement of the private sector is especially crucial in the implementation of technical vocational education and training (TVET). Its role in TVET is not only in terms of training provision but also includes a range of other areas. These comprise policy formulation, in curricula development, the

setting of occupational standards priority setting, labour demand forecasting, curricular and quality indicators, and on-the-job training” (↑African Union, accessed Nov. 2018).

11.1.1. Private education providers in Nigeria

A look at Nigeria is instructive with regard to private TVET providers, as information from the National Board for Technical Education (↑NBTE) is readily available, abundant and up-to-date, for both public and private providers. Table 11.1 provides a summary of the numbers of these providers, by type. In 2017, the NBTE published a ‘Directory of Accredited Programmes Offered in Polytechnics, Technical and Vocational Institutions’, listing the year of establishment and ownership of each institution, alongside the list of fully accredited TVET programmes. The current volume of this Directory, now in its 19th edition, has 241 pages (↑Government of Nigeria, 2017). The NBTE also provides a digest of the annual statistics documents of TVET institutions, the latest available version of which contains data from 2014–15 (↑ibid.). It was therefore possible to do a more in-depth analysis of the importance and prevalence of TVET providers in Nigeria than elsewhere in SSA. According to the NBTE, the TVET institutions falling outside the universities are

“the Polytechnics and Colleges of Technology, the Monotechnics – which is further sub-grouped into Colleges of Agriculture and Related Disciplines, Colleges of Health Sciences and Specialised Institutions – Innovation Enterprise Institutions (IEIs), Vocational Enterprise Institutions (VEIs) and Technical Colleges” (↑ibid.:iv).

Table 11.1. Number of accredited TVET providers in Nigeria per institutional ownership (↑National Board for Technical Education)²

Type of Institution	Federal	State	Private
Polytechnics	29	48	55
Innovation Enterprise Institutions (IEI)	6	4	143
Vocational Enterprise Institutions (VEI)	7	4	71
Technical Colleges	11	106	2
Specialised Institutions	24	3	4
Colleges of Health, Science and Technology	25	18	7
Colleges of Agriculture	19	14	–
TOTAL	121	197	282

TVET in Nigeria has been under ongoing reform for several years now. In 2007/8, Vocational Enterprise Institutions (↑VEI) and Innovation Enterprise Institutions (↑IEI) began operating. These are occupation-specific institutions which are supported by the private

sector, and provide an alternative route to higher education. According to UNEVOC, the IEs and VEs were introduced in Nigeria

“to intensify private sector engagement and improve the relevance of the training to the job market, while providing popular means of skilling and re-skilling workforce” (↑[UNESCO-UNEVOC, 2012:12](#)).

11.1.2. Private education providers in Botswana

In Botswana, there are 45 public institutions providing TVET, of which eight are TVET colleges and 37 brigade centres (TVET centres) offering a certificate up to diploma level. According to the government, considering that 10,622 students are enrolled,

“this translates to 61% utilisation of facilities” (↑[Government of Botswana, 2015:25](#)).

11.1.3. Private education providers in Ethiopia

In Ethiopia, we could not access the website of the Ethiopian Ministry of Education during the entire period of data collection. Therefore, our information on the country’s TVET system is somewhat limited. The country’s education statistics report (↑[Ethiopia, 2011](#)) informs us that, in 2003, there were 58,033 graduates from government TVET institutions and 56,747 graduates from non-government TVET providers. This enables us to conclude that non-government institutions represent a significant part of TVET provision in Ethiopia, since they account for nearly half of all the TVET graduates in the country.

11.1.4. Private education providers in Ghana

In Ghana, there is the Ghana National Association of Private Vocational and Technical Institutions (↑[GNAVTI](#)), indicating the possibility of a network between private TVET providers, as well as official engagement in the sector’s national standards or policy drafting.

According to our research, the Ghana Education Service (↑[GES](#)) is responsible for the monitoring and evaluation of 26 public Technical Training Institutes (TTI) and private TVET providers. A list of the 115 public and private institutions accredited by COTVET is available online (↑[COTVET, 2020](#)).

11.1.5. Private education providers in Kenya

In Kenya, public and private education providers coexist, but the involvement of companies in state TVET is not common. One of the TVET Permanent Working Group (PWG) objectives is to *“strategize on ways to match the needs of the private sector with the public sector”*. It also is supposed to offer *“an entry point for the private sector to communicate its needs to stakeholders”* (↑[PWG, accessed Nov. 2019](#)). We were able to obtain the total number of accredited TVET institutions in the country: based on data last updated

in April 2018, there were 987 accredited institutions. This number includes all types of public and private TVET institutions in Kenya.

In the private sector, the work developed by the Kenya Association of Manufacturers ([†KAM](#)) stands out. KAM's Manufacturing Academy offers courses in the following core categories: Strategic Management, Manufacturing Management, and Technical Operations. The Academy wants to ensure that KAM's members

“remain at the cutting edge of the latest manufacturing research findings and service technology to enable them to remain competitive” ([†KAM, accessed Dec. 2018](#)).

KAM also provides a TVET Programme. As part of this programme, a three-month graduate internship in industry allocates each graduate to a mentor. In the two years since its launch, the programme aimed to place over 500 graduates on internships that should consequently convert into jobs. Another branch of the programme aimed to *“provide refresher training to industry employees based on identified skills gaps”* ([†KAM, accessed Dec. 2018](#)). KAM states that it

“facilitates travel logistics, mentorship training for supervisors and soft skills training. The industry provides practical skills training opportunities and assigns relevant supervisors to mentor the interns.” ([†KAM, accessed Dec. 2018](#)).

11.1.6. Private education providers in Tanzania

Tanzania is one of the countries where the private sector seems to have quite a significant role to play in the TVET system. According to the *Vocational Education and Training Authority* ([†VETA](#)), institutional-based training in Tanzania is provided through courses with different complexity (long and short courses). These are currently offered through the 29 VETA-owned centres and almost 538 centres under private ownership, other government agencies, faith-based organisations and civil society organisations ([†Government of Tanzania, accessed Dec. 2018](#)).

11.1.7. Private education providers in Uganda

Finally, in Uganda, the Directorate of Education Standards (DES), under the Ministry of Education and Sports, has two departments dedicated to TVET education: the Teacher Education Standards Department, and the Business Technical Vocational Education and Training Standards Department (BTNET). The latter has a portal which provides access to lists of TVET providers, their locations, and the programmes they offer ([†Government of Uganda, accessed Dec. 2018](#)).³ However, the portal lists only 14 private TVET providers a number significantly smaller than the number of public providers we ourselves could trace and that are discussed below. This casts doubt on the completeness of the portal.

³ The focus in this section is the evidence found on the prevalence of private TVET providers. Further and more broad information on DES, BTNET and other government departments can be found in Chapter 10.

The BTVET recognises skills acquired both formally and informally. It is expected

“to promote the development of formal and non-formal institutions in the public and private sector; to incorporate and support training by non-public BTVET institutions and non-formal enterprise-based training; [and] to link formal and non-formal education and training and their respective curriculae” (†Government of Uganda, 2008: 6).

According to the BTVET Act, private TVET providers in Uganda consist of three categories (†Government of Uganda, 2008: 8–9):

1. Non-public providers, which are non-governmental organisations, religious organisations and associations, private companies and individuals, who

“may provide BTVET [...] in accordance with BTVET principles, concepts and the established vocational qualifications framework” (†*ibid.*)

2. Non-formal providers, which

“shall provide training aimed at upgrading skills and promoting indigenous technology” (†*ibid.*)

and

3. Formal enterprise-based training, which

“shall provide industrial training” (†*ibid.*).

11.2. Participation and role of industry, commerce and other groups with interest in TVET

In some countries, the industrial or commercial sectors are formally involved in the TVET system as training providers, advisory committees or through policy and curriculum development in collaboration with the government. Lolwana and Oketch assert that

“whilst some countries report significant and formalised employer involvement in the TVET system, others can demonstrate little in this regard” (†Lolwana & Oketch, 2017:18).

In Ghana, state and private TVET institutions are trying to work together. COTVET, the national TVET authority in Ghana, has an advisory committee for vocational training – the Ghana National Association of Private Vocational and Technical Institutions (GNAVTI) – in which industry representatives are involved.

Fortanier and van Wijk cite the tourism industry’s involvement in TVET as an example of the role of foreign companies in TVET (†Mozambique, Tanzania, Ethiopia: Fortanier & van Wijk, 2010). The authors analysed the impact of foreign hotels on local employment, and found that foreign hotels provided formal advanced training to its employees less often than local hotels. Additionally, their findings showed that, in general,

“foreign hotels with a high proportion of expatriates in their management do provide significantly more advanced formal training than foreign hotels that do not have a high proportion of expat managers” (†ibid.:202).

11.2.1. Insights from the literature

In Botswana, Ghana and Kenya there was a record of intentions to involve the industry, skills councils and other stakeholders in curriculum design (Botswana: †Government of Botswana, 1997; Ghana: Ghana Skills Development Initiative, 2019; †Kenya: †UNESCO-UNEVOC, 2018). In Kenya, according to UNEVOC, the engagement of other players goes beyond that, for example,

“to develop occupational standards and actively participate in curriculum assessment to ensure their compliance with the latest competency levels” (†UNESCO-UNEVOC, 2018: 7).

It is worth mentioning that Mayaka & King’s research findings indicate that in Kenya,

“there appears to be an insufficient incidence of formal training incorporating on-the-job experience and this poses a challenge for both industry operators and education-providers” (†Kenya: Mayaka & King, 2002:130).

In Nigeria, we found evidence of the participation of industry in curriculum development (†UNESCO-UNEVOC, 2012:7). Through desk-based research, we identified that Nigeria’s National Skills Qualifications Standards are sector-specific and set by industry. Training in the country is provided by education institutions in partnership with industry, and the skills prescribed in the national standards are assessed at both the workplace and training centres.

We found very little reference to other institutions involved in TVET apart from what has already been discussed above in the research literature. The SCR provided some further guidance on the subject.

11.2.2. Insights from interviews and focus groups

In the interviews and focus groups, we obtained additional insights regarding the role of the industry and other actors in Cameroon, Ethiopia, Ghana, Kenya, Madagascar, Namibia, South Africa and Zambia.

Cameroon

In Cameroon, businesses are involved in designing curricula and ensuring these address their needs. As the educational system moves towards competency-based training, strategies have been put in place to involve companies in student training. The aim is for trainees to acquire field competency, put the theoretical course into practice, and become adept at using relevant equipment, which is not necessarily available at all schools. The Ministry of Secondary Education is responsible for establishing partnerships with businesses for TVET internships and has established a service that negotiates

places for students within companies. However, a disconnect between training and businesses is still present despite these recent efforts.

Partnerships enabling internships to be carried out in industry were also cited by participants from Kenya, Madagascar and Tanzania. In the latter country, at the Arusha Technical College, for example, members from industry are also regularly invited to share their experience by giving lectures and demonstrating practical skills.

Ethiopia

Our interviewees and focus group participants reported that business participation is weak, and partnerships are not the norm, in Ethiopia, Ghana and South Africa. As mentioned in Section 11.1.3, in Ethiopia, despite the existence of legislation determining that training be done largely within industry, the small size of the industrial sector, together with management problems, has prevented the college-based TVET system in the country from shifting to a more practical approach. Trade unions are not very strong and there might be some collaboration locally, but it is not very visible. The government was intending to help establish partnerships with businesses, but the participants have not yet seen evidence of this.

Ghana

In Ghana too, the formal sector only engages in TVET at local level and the extent to which it commits to do so varies. Businesses are not eager to participate, relying on the TVET institutions to contact them, but TVET programme planners and implementers are not managing to do this sufficiently. The majority of small businesses in Ghana operate in the informal sector. SCR participant Christina Boateng, in the interview, expressed the view that these small businesses might feel that they have nothing to offer. Whether or not that is the case, programmes are not aligned with the needs of industry, leading Christina Boateng (University of Cape Coast, Ghana) to stress the need to come together and design programmes that meet demand.

Kenya

In Kenya, students from the Technical University of Mombasa, which was a TVET college before becoming a university, go on to train in industry for periods of many months, and they have observed that this is a programme that works very well. The Kenya Association of Technical Training Institutions (KATTI) organises industrial training and attachments, and was cited as being an asset in supporting the technical elements of these partnerships between companies and training institutions. Yet although Kenya is implementing the dual system, business participation is not at the level that it could be.

Madagascar

We were informed that in Madagascar, there is good cooperation between TVET institutions and industry. The government does not explicitly prescribe the curriculum but considers compliance with certain requirements. Each programme is designed by a team of teachers and professionals from companies or trade unions, then validated

by the National Accreditation Council. The curriculum is updated by the National Accreditation Council at the beginning of most academic years. Students also spend 8–12 weeks each year in industry, with an additional 30 weeks of classroom teaching (one semester is 15 weeks).

Namibia

Similar to Cameroon, businesses in Namibia are also involved in designing curricula, ensuring that they address their needs. Namibia is moving towards compulsory industrial attachment for all TVET students and soon, no-one will be certified as artisan without industry exposure. Currently, there is participation in industry to an extent. Trade unions and other actors do get involved in the labour market analysis when identifying occupations that are in demand and need to be developed. Since the Industry Skills Committee was introduced in 2008, there have been improvements. The Committee represents various sectors of the economy and plays a critical role in identifying skills gaps in the respective industrial sectors.

South Africa

In South Africa, business participation in TVET has not been given the necessary support, and current partnerships are episodic depending on TVET colleges reaching out. We are informed that businesses are usually dissatisfied with the education outcomes (leavers' skills) from arrangements made with colleges. Once again, the creation of partnerships with small businesses is encouraged by participants in the SCR as a means to increase TVET and industry collaborations.

Zambia

In Zambia, a government department – the Technical Education, Vocational and Entrepreneurship Training Authority (TEVETA) – works to ensure that businesses are involved in the curriculum design, in order to guarantee that training addresses the needs of the industry. The government also established the Skills Development Fund (SDF) a few years ago. Industry contributes financially to the SDF, and is involved in deciding how it is utilised.

11.2.3 Specific sectors

Participants in the SCR highlighted certain industries where partnerships seem to work better than in others. The ICT sector is cited as a field of work where partnerships between companies and TVET institutions work quite well, although, as Lova Zakariasy (Higher Institute of Technology of Antsiranana, Madagascar) points out, these pairings are only of limited value because, while students can find jobs easily, they tend to work as sales assistants rather than IT technicians. Civil and naval engineering are reported as providing good partnerships, as are energy, water and maintenance companies. Tourism is one of the sectors where these partnerships could also be successful, according to Francis Teal (Centre for the Study of African Economies, University of Oxford and IZA, UK), but, he adds, there has not been sufficient investment to generate a demand.

11.3. Chapter bibliography

This bibliography can be accessed from the [↑entry for this document in our evidence library](#).

African Union / Home. (n.d.). Retrieved November 5, 2018, from <https://au.int/> ([↑record](#))

COTVET. (2020). *Accredited Institutions*. <https://cotvet.gov.gh/accredited-institutions/> ([↑record](#))

Fortanier, F., & Wijk, J. van. (2010). Sustainable tourism industry development in sub-Saharan Africa: Consequences of foreign hotels for local employment. *International Business Review*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ibusrev.2010.07.001> ([↑record](#))

Ghana Education Service. (n.d.). <http://ghanaschoolsinfo.org/syllabus> ([↑record](#))

Ghana National Association of Private Vocational and Technical Institutions. (n.d.). http://www.gnapvti.org/index.php?option=com_content&view=featured&layout=number:blank&Itemid=784 ([↑record](#))

Government of Botswana. (1997). *National Policy on Vocational Education and Training*. ([↑record](#))

Government of Botswana. (2015). *ETSSP 2015-2020 - Education & Training Sector Strategic Plan*. ([↑record](#))

Government of Ethiopia. (2011). *Education Statistics Annual Abstract*. <http://www.moe.gov.et/documents/20182/23015/Education+Statistics+Annual+Abstract/993180be-b6a2-44d3-9353-71b468be46dd> ([↑record](#))

Government of Nigeria. (2017). *Digest of TVET institutions statistics in Nigeria 2014-15*. <https://net.nbte.gov.ng/sites/default/files/2018-02/DIGEST%20OF%20TVET%20INSTITUTIONS%20STATISTICS%20IN%20NIGERIA%202014-15.pdf> ([↑record](#))

Government of Nigeria. (2017). *Directory of Accredited Programmes Offered in Polytechnics, Technical and Vocational Institutions*. <https://net.nbte.gov.ng/sites/default/files/2018-02/2017%20DIRECTORY%20OF%20INSTITUTIONS%20UNDER%20THE%20PURVIEW%20OF%20NBTE.pdf> ([↑record](#))

Government of Nigeria. (n.d.). *National Board for Technical Education*. Retrieved December 6, 2018, from <https://net.nbte.gov.ng/> ([↑record](#))

Government of Tanzania. (n.d.). *Vocational Education and Training Authority*. Retrieved December 8, 2018, from <http://www.veta.go.tz/> ([↑record](#))

Government of Uganda. (2008). *BTVET Act - Business, Technical, Vocational Education Act and Training Act*. <http://www.unche.or.ug/wp-content/uploads/2014/11/BVET-Act-20081.pdf> ([↑record](#))

Government of Uganda. (n.d.). *Uganda BTVET Portal*. Retrieved December 8, 2018, from <http://www.btvvet-uganda.org/> ([↑record](#))

Haßler, B., Stock, I., Schaffer, J., Winkler, E., Kagambèga, A., Haseloff, G., Marsden, M., Watson, J., Gordon, R., & Damani, K. (2019). *Berufsbildung in Sub-Sahara Afrika: Stand der Forschung* (Berufsbildung in SSA). VET Repository, Bundesinstitut für Berufsbildung, Bonn, Germany. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3334690> (↑record)

Inauguration of Sector Skills Bodies and subsequent Study Tour to India | Ghana skills Development. (n.d.). Retrieved August 7, 2020, from <http://www.ghanaskills.org/node/159> (↑record)

Innovation Enterprise Institutions. (n.d.). Retrieved August 4, 2020, from <https://net.nbte.gov.ng/IEIs> (↑record)

KAM. (n.d.). *Kenya Association of Manufacturers (Kenya)*. Retrieved December 9, 2018, from <http://kam.co.ke/> (↑record)

Lolwana, P., & Oketch, M. O. (2017). Introduction Keynotes - Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Sub-Saharan Africa: the missing middle in post-school education. In *Vocational Education and Training in Sub-Saharan Africa* (pp. 11–38). <https://www.wbv.de/artikel/6004570w011> (↑record)

Mayaka, M., & King, B. (2002). A Quality assessment of education and for Kenya's tour-operating sector. *Current Issues in Tourism*. <https://doi.org/10/dkhvf5> (↑record)

National Board for Technical Education. (n.d.). Retrieved August 4, 2020, from <https://net.nbte.gov.ng/accredited%20institutions> (↑record)

Permanent Working Group. (n.d.). <https://tvetinkenya.net/about-us> (↑record)

UNESCO-UNEVOC. (2012). *UNEVOC World TVET Database: Nigeria.* (↑record)

UNESCO-UNEVOC. (2018). *UNEVOC World TVET Database: Kenya.* <https://unevoc.unesco.org/go.php?q=World+TVET+Database&ct=KEN> (↑record)

Vocational Education and Training Authority. (n.d.). Retrieved August 4, 2020, from <https://www.veta.go.tz/> (↑record)

Vocational Enterprise Institutions. (n.d.). Retrieved August 4, 2020, from <https://net.nbte.gov.ng/VEI> (↑record)