Chapter 9. Inclusion-related Challenges and Policies[1]

This chapter considers inclusion and gender issues in TVET in SSA, as well as related challenges and strategies (RQ12). Here, we present an analysis of the state guidelines of some countries in SSA that are related to the laws and regulations on inclusion. The following discussion offers information on institutional guidelines and strategic plans evidenced through our internet search (RQ21). In Chapter 13 we discuss challenges to implementing these inclusion-related policies.

Research questions considered in this chapter

The research question considered in this chapter is listed in the box below.

Research questions considered in this chapter
[RQ12.] What are the main **inclusion-related challenges** (equal treatment, e.g., gender, disability) in TVET in SSA? What are the successes and failures with respect to inclusion in TVET implementations?

Conclusions of this chapter

All of the research on gender in the studies we reviewed emphasises acceptance of the fact that women have the same capabilities for acquiring professional skills and competences as men. Yet despite this, publications from Ethiopia, Ghana, Uganda, Mozambique, Benin and Burkina Faso indicate that women are often unable to utilise their skills because the relevant opportunities for TVET are not always available to them. Researchers from Tanzania, Zambia and Zimbabwe found that women often do not even consider apprenticeships. The same structural gender inequalities (e.g., caring responsibilities and low participation of women in mathematics, computer science, science and technology subjects – so-called STEM subjects) affect the choice of occupations and TVET as in Western Europe. This is shown by studies from Ghana, Kenya, Benin, Congo, Burkina Faso and Mozambique. It is established that teachers / educators play a central role in addressing gender inequity, so their education should become an important field

---

1 Citation for this chapter: Haßler, Haseloff, et al. (2020). *Chapter 9. Inclusion-related Challenges and Policies.* In: Haßler, Haseloff, et al. (2020). *Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Systematic Review of the Research Landscape.* VET Repository, Bundesinstitut für Berufsbildung, Bonn, Germany. https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3843349

of research (cf., publications from Ghana, Nigeria, Sierra Leone, Gambia, Liberia and Malawi). Kenyan studies, in particular, examine the right to — and the available opportunities for — free and equal access to TVET for all people.

This chapter also discusses the disadvantages of other vulnerable groups in society. Some people have fewer opportunities for education than others because of their economic status, locality, age, ethnicity, religion and sexual orientation. One study from Uganda indicates that TVET for refugees can be a way to integrate them into a new community (Section 9.4.6). In terms of access to the labour market, SSA often also considers young people to be disadvantaged (Section 9.3.5.).

Even those young people who have TVET may still be disadvantaged when entering the labour market due to having only been taught overly theoretical TVET, and having limited experience in the workplace compared to older people (Section 9.3.5.).

We note that most of the documents we have reviewed simply indicate that access to TVET needs to be facilitated for minority groups and that governments and state authorities should be encouraged to do so. However, specific suggestions as to how this could be implemented in practice— or has already been implemented — are rarely found. Section 9.3. presents some examples from Ghana, Botswana, Kenya and Eritrea.

In employment relationships, and thus also in TVET in industrialised countries, approaches to equal opportunities and integration have long played an important role (⭡Hobler, et al., 2020). According to a study from the Institute of Economic and Social Research in Düsseldorf, even in countries with the highest standard of living, progress towards integration has been slow, and is far from complete (⭡ibid.).

In addition to social, societal and family aspects, cultural aspects also have a far-reaching influence on the current status and future development opportunities (⭡ibid.). Certainly it is the case that there are significant cultural obstacles regarding equality of opportunity and integration. Arguably, these existing overarching conditions rarely permit a direct replacement of existing approaches (⭡Kleefeldt, 2018). Nevertheless, the focus should be on exploring how experiences in other countries and cultures could contribute to driving forward progress on the pertinent issues, avoiding potential delays and dead-ends.

As with the other chapters, the subsequent sections offer additional details of the points discussed in the summary above.

9.1. Gender

We now consider women's access to education. We note that none of the documents we discovered contain any discussions on non-binary gender.

9.1.1. Women's access to education

Mulder and Roelofs' review notes that over the last 20 years, the presence of women in TVET programmes has increased all over the world (⭡South Africa, Ghana: Mulder & Roelofs, 2012). Alade examines the acquisition of professional skills and basic

professional knowledge in technical training, and cannot demonstrate any significant gender differences (⬆Nigeria: Alade, 2015). Thus, Alade asserts that

> *"the low enrollment of females in technical education programmes in Nigeria is probably the result of the belief that technical education is mostly for males"* (⬆ibid.:65).

In Mozambique, Romiszowski states that

> *"the officially verified figure for the proportion of females in the formal, public-sector, secondary TVET system in 2011 was 34.1%"* (⬆Mozambique: Romiszowski, 2015).

Ethiopia, Botswana and Uganda stand out as the only countries where we are able to find official state documents dedicated specifically to addressing the issue of gender in education. In Ethiopia, there are two documents that were both published in 2014: the Gender Strategy for the Education and Training Sector (⬆Government of Ethiopia, 2014) and the Gender Responsive Pedagogy Manual (⬆Government of Ethiopia, 2014). The latter is an adaptation to the Ethiopian context of the Teachers' Handbook on Gender-Responsive Pedagogy, a document developed by the Forum for African Women Educationalists to be used as a practical guide for developing learning and teaching processes that are gender-responsive within an African context (⬆FAWE). According to the study by Galukande et al., measures for gender justice in secondary education should not be the only focus (⬆Uganda: Galukande, et al., 2018).

It is important to ensure that girls have equal access to education early in their educational careers. According to Galukande and colleagues, schools should be sensitised to the topic, and developments

> *"such as improving access at the secondary level for science subjects for girls and rural children need to be consolidated if we are to expect real change"* (⬆ibid.:94).

For similar reasons, the Revised National Youth Policy in Botswana includes gender as a cross-cutting issue, stating that

> *"progress has been made with gender equality but challenges remain and need to be addressed"* (⬆Government of Botswana, 2010: 3).

It establishes strategies aimed at altering the disadvantages faced by women, which are listed as follows:

> *"Women have long been disadvantaged in many respects, in education, training, income, economic rights and decision-making. Young women face particular difficulties in society such as higher levels of unemployment as compared to young men, few occupational opportunities and high number of pregnancies"* (⬆ibid.:25).

We note that this quote describes a *"high number of pregnancies"* as a *"particular difficulty"*.

Uganda also has a Gender in Education Policy, currently in its second edition (⇡Government of Uganda, 2016). The first policy was published in September 2010 and was intended to last for six years. The current Gender in Education Policy has the following main goals and objectives:

1. Enhance equal participation for all in the education system;
2. Promote the provision of relevant knowledge and skills equally to males and females;
3. Ensure gender-responsive planning, budgeting, programming, monitoring and evaluation of education;
4. Promote an enabling and protective environment for all persons.

The Ministry of Education in Uganda stresses that the introduction of gender equality in education is a task in which all partners involved in education must participate:

> *"The successful implementation of the Second Gender in Education Policy will depend on the synergistic and collective actions of all stakeholders including the Education Development Partners (EDPs), Ministries, Agencies and Local Governments (MALGs), Religious Institutions, Cultural Institutions, Satellite Institutions, Civil Society Organisations (CSOs), Private Sector and all Ugandans."* (⇡Government of Uganda, 2016:i).

9.1.2. Women in TVET

According to the reviewed literature, women are under-represented in TVET. Vandenbosch's review found that, while women play an important role in agriculture, they are still under-represented in agricultural education and training (⇡Ghana, Uganda, Benin, Ethiopia, Burkina Faso: Vandenbosch, 2006). NEPAD's literature review found that, for agricultural TVET to reach youth and women, education and capacity-building programmes must be defined in a more participatory way, and gender aspects must be taken into consideration when deciding the themes and setting the timing of these trainings (⇡Benin, Ethiopia, Namibia and Sierra Leone: NEPAD, 2013). The study suggests that this could be achieved by creating youth platforms that would determine training and capacity-building needs. NEPAD's review also concludes that there should be a focus on agricultural best practices and knowledge sharing. As Vandenbosch notes, gender issues must be considered explicitly because

> *"there is little or no guarantee that men actually transfer agricultural information, knowledge and skills to women farmers"* (⇡Ghana, Uganda, Benin, Ethiopia, Burkina Faso: Vandenbosch, 2006:10).

According to Vandenbosch, it is important to enshrine the rights of women and under-represented groups in law so that women can claim these rights (⇡ibid.). Acknowledging this, the Kenyan Technical and Vocational Education and Training Act determines that the Authority (TVETA)

> *"shall have regard to the objectives and needs of development of technical and vocational education and training and shall ensure that there are*

balanced competencies, gender equity, inclusion of persons with disabilities, the marginalised and other minority groups" (⇡Government of Kenya, 2013:11).

Additionally, the second strategic objective of the TVET Strategic Plan 2018–2022 aims to promote gender equity and equal opportunities in TVET in Kenya. The activities suggested to achieve this goal include

"advocating gender balance across institutions and programmes; advocating gender mainstreaming in programmes and to advocate gender friendly learning environments; [and] to advocate policies for disadvantaged groups in TVET" (⇡Government of Kenya, 2018:31).

Achandi and colleagues point out the situation in Ethiopia (⇡Ethiopia, Madagascar, Tanzania: Achandi, et al., 2018). In agricultural households, only the mostly male heads of household are entitled to TVET or further training (⇡ibid.).

In Tanzania however,

"extension services are provided to both male and female farmers by the government, international organisations such as Oxfam, through direct interaction with farmers" (⇡Tanzania, Ethiopia, Madagascar: Achandi, et al., 2018:188).

As a result, the authors concluded,

"empowerment of women in decision making at the household level can enhance women's access and engagement in better farming practices suggested under extension advisory services. This is specifically true where women are able to overcome the hurdles of acquisition of extension training and access to the improved technologies" (⇡Tanzania, Ethiopia, Madagascar: Achandi, et al., 2018:188).

Apart from the poorer access to TVET, it is also more difficult for women to complete the TVET, once it has started, without physical and psychological impairments, as the STEP study shows (⇡UNESCO, 2018).[2]STEP carried out a situational analysis on the status of sexual and reproductive health of students and gender-based violence in three technical and vocational colleges in Malawi. The study identified that respondents did not fully understand the term gender-based violence (GBV) and its dimensions. STEP's qualitative analysis unveiled an extensive list of sexual, emotional and physical gender-based violence experienced by respondents, which has led it to conclude that

"both male and female students are vulnerable to GBV with female students, especially those from poor households, being the most vulnerable" (⇡UNESCO, 2018:36).

---

2 This situational analysis study was commissioned by UNESCO's HIV and Health Education Unit in collaboration with Skills and Technical Education Programme (STEP), an initiative implemented by UNESCO with funding from the European Union.

Justina Ashiyana (SCR participant, Namibia) notes that a number of TVET institutions in Namibia have a low number of female students compared to male students — in most of these cases, female students account for less than 10%. However, she notes that there are some success stories. For example, in joinery and cabinet making, there are a significant number of women in TVET, perhaps almost as many as men.

9.1.3. Women's employment and the labour market

Women's under-representation in TVET may be related to local labour market characteristics, for even those women who had the necessary skills were frequently identified as facing difficulties in gaining employment (⇡Zambia: Muya, et al., 2006; ⇡Tanzania: Bennell, et al., 2006). Muya and colleagues indicated that during the 2002/2003 financial year analysed, about 50% of the larger-sized companies in Zambia did not employ skilled female craftspeople (⇡Zambia: Muya, et al., 2006). In a survey of 2000 graduates in Tanzania in early 2002, Bennell and colleagues found that only 22% were in an occupation related to their training; they state that *"female graduates have had considerably more difficulty utilising their occupational knowledge and skills"* (⇡Tanzania: Bennell, et al., 2006:79–80). They suggest that:

1. training-related employment rates are lowest for trades with the highest levels of formal sector employment (e.g., few secretarial and computing graduates worked in occupations related to their training), while
2. training-related employment rates are highest for trades, which have low formal sector employment but a high incidence of self-employment (e.g., carpentry and tailoring).

Asare and colleagues (2015), who analysed gender issues in micro, small and medium enterprises in Ghana and the implications for economic growth, found that women

> *"were constrained by ineffective marketing strategies, lack of capital, inadequate equipment and machinery, lack of improved technology, inadequate training and low skill development"* (⇡Ghana: Asare, et al., 2015:34).

Achandi and colleagues show that patriarchal structures often prevent women from acquiring the relevant skills for more highly valued jobs (⇡ibid.; also cf., Section 9.1.2.). As a result, they are also less well educated and take lower rated jobs, as Kambarami notes:

> *"because of patriarchy, women tend to occupy peripheral jobs in the economy because they lack relevant skills for important occupations"* (⇡Zimbabwe: Kambarami, 2006, cited in Wonder, 2017: 64).

In Zimbabwe, women are often confined to the informal sector (⇡ibid.:54). Wonder found that

> *"As a result of gender role socialisation, most women tend to engage in informal trading within the informal industry while most men are into manufacturing. Moreover, all informal apprentices but one in the informal industry were found to be female. It would seem the informal industry adopts the Women in*

Development (WID) approach without reorienting the patriarchal structures in the informal industry. This implies that, although the industry has reconstituted in terms of gender, the culturally embedded gender stereotypical roles tend to permeate the informal industry." (⇡ibid.).

Vandenbosch recommends, therefore, that gender aspects be more explicitly included in education reforms in the field; gender-sensitised and more targeted recruitment policies should be developed specifically to reach women (⇡Ghana, Uganda, Benin, Ethiopia, Burkina Faso: Vandenbosch, 2006).

Finally, Justina Ashiyana (SCR participant, Namibia) notes that most technical work is seen, culturally, as a male profession regardless of the fact that women are both mentally and physically fit to perform equally well. However, based on these cultural prejudices, the industry prefers to employ male over female workers. The equal treatment of women remains a challenge.

9.1.4. Gender-based roles, career choices and gender stereotypes

In many countries, some sectors are dominated by women, such as healthcare. Sectors that are mostly classified as technical are generally dominated by men. According to Romiszowski, courses that generally appeal most to girls are in the commercial, management, administrative, hotel and tourism sectors; on the other hand technical vocations, for example, engineering courses, mostly attract boys (⇡Mozambique: Romiszowski, 2015). The African Union stresses that

> *"some TVET programmes like dressmaking, hairdressing, and cookery are associated with girls – very often girls who are less gifted academically"* (⇡Ghana, Kenya, Benin, Democratic Republic of the Congo, Burkina Faso: African Union, 2007:8).

The African Union's strategy to revitalise TVET education in Africa, released in 2007, therefore highlights gender stereotyping as one of the key issues to be addressed. According to Masinire (⇡Zimbabwe: Masinire, 2015), the government of Zimbabwe took steps to equalise educational opportunities between boys and girls after political independence in 1980. The author explored the experiences of boys and girls in Foods and Nutrition and Metal Technology TVET courses in rural areas. The findings suggest that despite these subjects being seen by teachers as offering possibilities for dismantling students' understanding and preferences for non-traditional colonial subject choices, at the practical level, the TVET curriculum worked in ways that continued to structure and construct traditional gender hierarchies, roles and career expectations for boys and girls. The author concludes that

> *"In order to understand gender inequality in the Voc-Tech curriculum, educators need to understand how sociocultural perceptions of gender are constructed and embodied at the level of classroom interaction among students and teachers. Such insights provide a deeper understanding for addressing gender inequality in Voc-Tech subjects that moves beyond current structural and institutional barriers within a rural African context"* (⇡ibid.: 618).

Outside the immediate scope of TVET, we note an interesting study by Rogers and colleagues concerning tertiary education (⇡South Africa, Ghana: Rogers, Creed & Searle, 2012; cited in Mulder & Roelofs, 2012). The study looked at gender differences in how junior doctors chose specialisms; it found that, in general, the professional choices of women are more lifestyle-friendly, e.g., choosing to work part-time. Women also feel they lack support and opportunities to learn, and — more so than men — have to create alternative development opportunities on their own. Mulder & Roelofs also make the point that men may benefit from being in the minority within the workplace (e.g., one male teacher among a group of otherwise female teachers), while women are disadvantaged and undervalued by comparison (e.g., one female construction worker among a group of male construction workers) (⇡South Africa, Ghana: Mulder & Roelofs, 2012).

We note that these findings can also be confirmed by gender research in Germany.[3] The same structural gender inequalities also occur here (e.g., Responsibility for care, low participation of women in *"Mathematics, Informatics, Science and Technology",* STEM, subjects; (⇡BMBF).

9.1.5. Gender and teacher education

Colley points to "*gender and teacher education"* as one of the themes that emerged from his research synthesis; it merits further consideration within future research (⇡Ghana, Nigeria, Sierra Leone, Gambia, Liberia: Colley, 2014).

In Malawi, Safford and colleagues state that teaching is a male-dominated profession, it being common

> *"for schools to have no female teachers and for girls never to experience a woman teacher as a role model; gender discrimination, harassment and the exclusion of girls can go unchallenged in these kinds of learning environments."* (⇡Malawi: Safford, et al., 2013:194).

Future teachers would have to cope with the problems that Safford identifies: the isolation of rural life, gender violence, and family-imposed barriers (⇡ibid.). Many young girls and women are more at risk than young men, and face multiple disadvantages because of too much housework, unequal treatment compared to male classmates and long distances to school, as well as forced marriages and sexual abuse (⇡ibid., ⇡UNESCO, 2018).

In Ethiopia, women comprise less than 20% of secondary school teachers, which led Abay to investigate why many women who enter university do not make it into teaching in school, and why many of those who enter teaching do not stay in the profession (⇡Ethiopia: Abay, 2016). The author found that the persistent fear of sexual harassment, its continuing incidence and the poor response of institutions were among the primary factors, concluding that

---

3 ⇡Bundesministerium für Bildung und Forschung, Genderforschung, *available at* https://www.bmbf.de/de/genderforschung-222.html

"Much work is needed, therefore, to improve current approaches to addressing sexual harassment, to counter the backlash of faculty and others who believe it is a thing of the past, and to support Gender Offices in their roles to address not only these more extreme manifestations but also other prevalent gender biases and discriminatory practices" (⇡Ethiopia: Abay, 2016:263).

9.2. People with disabilities

Overall, we encountered few studies on people with disabilities. People with disabilities are negatively affected in access and use of TVET programmes, due to the inaccessible design of such programmes. Mulder and Roelofs show that people with disabilities are affected by a low level of education and low key competencies (⇡South Africa, Ghana: Mulder & Roelofs, 2012). Since education plays a key role in getting employment, it is no surprise that the findings also point to the low level of job-participation within this group (⇡ibid.). The chances of a self-determined life with full participation in all social activities are thus reduced. Recommendations include the implementation of inclusive education followed by socially supported employment. We are particularly interested in a study by Malle (⇡Kenya, Tanzania: Malle, 2016). Among the research projects we have examined, this one deals with the topic of handicap and TVET most comprehensively.

Malle finds that

> *"the participation of students with disabilities in vocational education programmes in Kenya and Tanzania was insignificant due to their limited access to the services (related to teaching and training) of TVET colleges"* (⇡ibid.:60).

The following factors negatively affect the participation of students with disabilities in formal TVET in Kenya and Tanzania, where, Malle stresses, there has been no concrete progress made regarding access:

1. negative attitude of society and of the parents of children with disabilities, in particular towards the potential and capacity of students with disabilities;
2. lack of an adapted and modified curriculum responsive to the special educational and training needs of students with disabilities;
3. lack of specialised and adaptive equipment and technologies;
4. lack of clear guidelines on the provision of adaptive skills and equipment such as sign language interpretation and assistive devices;
5. lack of funding allocated for the promotion of inclusive education and training regardless of the availability of disability support allowance in Kenya;
6. inaccessibility of the physical environment and accommodation services of TVET centres and institutions;
7. lack of proper integration of trainees with disabilities in the regular training system;
8. lack of adequate ICT qualified staff, trained in special needs education (⇡ibid.:59).

The literature demonstrates that the issue of disability is not adequately addressed in either education policies or in policy implementation. The findings reported by Malle (↕Kenya, Tanzania: Malle, 2016) indicate that

> *"regardless of the political goodwill observed on the part of the governments of the study countries [Kenya, Tanzania], including Ethiopia, the commitment to the implementation of those disability-mainstreamed policies and legal instruments remains limited. This limitation continues to adversely affect the educational and training rights of persons with disabilities as well as their full and effective participation in the regular vocational education systems"* (↕ibid.: 61).

The participants of Malle's study made the following recommendations for enhancing the participation of students with disabilities in regular TVET programmes:

1. Adapt and modify the curriculum according to the special educational training needs of students with disabilities.
2. Mainstream special needs education as a compulsory course in the curriculum of education programmes for trainers.
3. Carry out research on the issue of disability and TVET.
4. Allocate adequate resources, being mindful of the special educational and training needs of students with disabilities.
5. Increase the availability of specialised facilities, equipment, technology and assistive devices.
6. Provide special funds for alumni with disabilities to enable them to engage in self-employment or income-generating activities (by starting a business) after completing their education.
7. Conduct policy reviews and amend the national policy and legal documents with the objective of being more inclusive of special educational and training needs and the rights of people with disabilities.
8. Make communities aware of the basic, as well as specific, needs and rights of people with disabilities.

(↕ibid.:60).

Some studies identify approaches that could be used to meet these recommendations. In Somalia, ongoing civil war has increased the prevalence of disabilities, which is estimated to affect between 15% and 20% of the population. According to ↕Maina (2016), the country has identified and prioritised the needs of people with disabilities and special educational needs, and has worked on plans for collaboration and partnership that have led to four areas of interventions: improving access to education; providing micro-grants; improving access to sustainable livelihoods for young people with disabilities; and capacity-building for local disabled people's organisations in advocacy and resource mobilisation.

In policies and through state authorities in Uganda, we found instructions for arrangements to support those with special needs in taking their TVET examinations (⇡Government of Uganda, 2014).

Another example comes from Nigeria, where the Education Act No. 16, dating from 1985, states that a Minister should consult with interested parties before prescribing any minimum standards in respect of special and adult and non-formal education, and *"may set up such committees as he considers appropriate to advise him"* (⇡Government of Nigeria, 1985). The document includes sections on minimum standards with respect to special and adult education. Therefore, in Nigeria, special needs education has been included in the policy debate since the 1980s. In Kenya, the Ministry of Education has been implementing the National Special Needs Education Policy Framework since 2009. According to this policy, inclusive education for learners with physical, visual, hearing, speech and other impairments is to be encouraged and strengthened.

9.3. Vulnerable groups

This section looks at research findings that present government procedures and strategies to support vulnerable groups in TVET. In our understanding, vulnerable groups are those at risk due to their economic status, geographical location, age, ethnicity, religion and sexual orientation. This includes refugees, asylum seekers and internally displaced people. There is little literature available on this, so we limit ourselves to examples in Ghana, Botswana, Kenya and Eritrea.

9.3.1. National qualifications programmes in Ghana

Sonnenberg has been monitoring the informal sector in Ghana. He claims that Ghana's Ministry of Employment and Labour Relations has identified high unemployment rates among vulnerable groups (including young people, women, and people with disabilities) as one of the main challenges for employment policy (⇡Ghana, Senegal: Sonnenberg, 2012). Those in charge would know that vulnerable and excluded people should be included as productive members of the economy (⇡Ghana, Senegal: National Employment Policy, quoted in Sonnenberg, 2012). Based on their findings, the author argues,

> *"national skills training programmes such as Ghana's NAP [National Adaptation Plan] have generally targeted youth in urban areas and those with a minimum of basic education. Therefore, it is difficult to gauge the extent to which these initiatives have improved access to skills training for those who currently have little education. Moreover, it is not clear whether these initiatives have improved the basic education levels of youth with no prior education or who have dropped out of basic education"* (⇡Ghana, Senegal: National Employment Policy, quoted in Sonnenberg, 2012:101).

9.3.2. Affordable fees for disadvantaged students in Kenya

Nganyi and colleagues state that the challenges that affect students' access to TVET institutions in Kenya are yet to be mitigated (↑Nganyi, et al., 2014). The authors analysed the methods devised by Kenyan TVET Institutions geared toward boosting high enrolment rates. To assist needy students in accessing TVET, some Kenyan institutions (National Polytechnics, Technical Training Institutes and Institutes of Technology) have started bursary schemes. The expectation was that all those who came from low socioeconomic backgrounds should apply for these funds. Other strategies investigated by the study were the following: good performance, advertisement, attractiveness, opening of more learning centres in towns and open and distance education. They found that

> *"The factors that seem to be highly used to attract students are affordable fees (57.5%), marketability of courses (55%) and advertisement of courses (39%). The strategies that have least impact on access include use of distance and on-line learning (69.5%) and opening of study centres/campuses (24.5%)"* (↑ibid.:72).

As affordability is one of the main factors attracting students to TVET, fees subsidy is also discussed. This can be applied in terms of work-study, waiving fees for students, and institutional bursaries. Regarding bursaries, the authors assert that the amount spent on this subsidy can influence access to TVET to a large extent. However, this study revealed that only 5.25% of the respondents applied for a bursary provided by the education institution, and of these applicants, only 33.3% actually received the bursary. The authors stress that *"this is such a small number that the effect may not be felt"* (↑ibid.:70).

9.3.3. Media education in Eritrea

The government of Eritrea created a five-year plan that laid out its vision for education, addressing the gaps to access, equity, quality and the relevance of the education system. According to ↑Murthy (2006), this document included

> *"plans to construct classrooms in under-served areas of population, to increase recruitment of female teachers, to implement community-based campaigns, to raise gender awareness within communities and the teaching force, to revise the curricula and the teaching materials in keeping with gender-sensitive policies, to open boarding schools and hostels for girls in remote areas and to ensure grade I entry at the right age"* (↑Eritrea: Murthy, 2006:184).

The author asserts that the Eritrean Government decided to invest significantly in media education as a sustainable alternative to conventional education. This was intended to offer equitable access to disadvantaged groups and was seen as a means to quickly bridge the growing knowledge gap between the country and the rest of the world. The term 'media education' is treated here in a broad sense, where radio and TV transmissions of educational programmes take precedence over other forms. Few technical

courses were offered by the government through its TVET institutions to those who have completed school year 9. Media education was implemented to provide single-episode educational programmes in certain skills. Murthy provides in his article the design of courses and curricula for teachers and students who wish to join national mainstream education through media education programmes and a National Open School. The author describes the aim of this initiative as being

> *"to meet the educational requirements of the deprived, displaced and remotely located, economically weaker population of Eritrea, including women, held back by tradition and religion. (...) Secondly, it is meant to cover dropouts, women and girls conditioned by or bound to traditions, who cannot move away from home to be educated"* (⇡Eritrea: Murthy, 2006:193–194).

9.3.4. Policies in Botswana

Botswana's Education and Training Sector Strategic Plan proposes extensive reforms to transform the country's education system (⇡Government of Botswana, 2015). Improving equitable access to education is one of their strategic priorities, addressing issues of quality, relevance, access, equity and accountability across the entire education sector in order to improve outcomes for all learners. The document notes, however, that no performance indicators have been developed on equity. Hence, the country's data on such issues are poor and the challenges faced by those most vulnerable are not entirely clear. The government recognised that:

> *"The definition of who the disadvantaged groups are also need to be spelt out in the form of policy. Access for minority groups, such as those in remote areas, those with disability and associated challenges, deserve particular attention/focus by the sub-sector. Women's participation in the Sciences is very low and in need of immediate attention"* (⇡ibid.:26).

The country's National Policy on Vocational Education and Training, published nearly two decades earlier, proposed that priority should be given to disadvantaged groups in the provision of training, pointing out that:

> *"Where necessary special training programmes will be established to cater for the needs of special groups. Efforts will be made both by the vocational education and training system as well as the general education system to change entrenched societal stereotypes regarding vocational education and training. Access will be opened for initial training, re-training and skills upgrading for adults"* (⇡Botswana, 1997:14).

According to Botswana's Sector Strategic Plan, the TVET department *"has an equal opportunities policy that reserves a 15% quota for admission of students from disadvantaged backgrounds."* (⇡Government of Botswana, 2015:26). The document notes that:

> *"Currently TVET institutions, (colleges and brigades) though not fully utilised, are not able to accommodate learners with special needs. Four institutions have however been earmarked special education 'schools'. There*

is no indication of a robust and deliberate plan to recruit the disabled, the disadvantaged and other vulnerable groups into TVET. To overcome these shortcomings, most of the existing facilities will need to be upgraded to accommodate the learners with special education needs. Furthermore, there will need to change policies to create 'school of skills' with special dispensation for admission; to develop unique programmes and to adopt delivery methods to suit people with special needs" (⇡ibid.:25).

9.3.5. Youth policies in Botswana, Ghana and Senegal

The Revised National Youth Policy in Botswana lists several strategic areas, including a few dedicated to gender and vulnerable youth. The policy states that one of Botswana's weaknesses is the inadequate access of young people *"to complementary factors of production such as finance, land and skills"* (⇡Government of Botswana, 2010:4). Regarding skills, the policy states the following:

"Understanding of the specific needs and interests of each group is limited and needs to be improved. The rehabilitation of ex-convicts/juveniles, sex workers, and youth victims of abuse has not received adequate attention in terms of gender balance and livelihood strategies. There is, therefore, an urgent need to adequately empower these vulnerable groups for their economic survival" (ibid.:20).

Some of the strategies presented to address this situation include designing and implementing effective special support programmes and providing appropriate infrastructure, facilities and services. Thus, the policy aims to promote youth development by the implementation of programmes and activities targeting this group in particular, which include upgrading and expanding specialised institutions serving vulnerable youth. The document asserts that its goals would be met by

"ensuring equitable access to appropriate programmes and services regardless of their geographic location, race, gender, disability, social, religious and economic circumstances" (ibid.:10)

The governments of Ghana and Senegal have also created policies and programmes to increase access to, and the quality of, non-formal skills training, with the aim of better preparing their populations for work in the informal sector. ⇡Sonnenberg (2012) carried out an extensive review of the literature which revealed that these two countries have long histories of traditional apprenticeship and that these forms of skills training reach more young people than formal TVET. The author states that Ghana's and Senegal's *"strategies to confront youth unemployment do not provide enough support services to disadvantaged and marginalised youth, especially those youth with no education or low levels of education"* (⇡Ghana; Senegal: Sonnenberg, 2012:101). She found that many of the programmes intended to modernise traditional apprenticeship favoured those with higher levels of education and those in urban areas. The author concluded that:

"traditional apprenticeship is a ubiquitous form of training for youth, essential for providing skills to those unable to access formal training. (...) Unfortunately, there is little data on the long-term outcomes of these initiatives, programmes and reforms. Therefore, it is difficult to evaluate the impact that these changes have in providing the pathways for young people to obtain the skills they need to prosper in the workplace" (⇡ibid.).

9.3.6. Refugees in Uganda

Through the internet search, we found only one programme being developed in Uganda that aimed at integrating refugees into the economy.[4] The Directorate of Industrial Training (DIT) produced a video, available on its YouTube channel, presenting the main characteristics of the programme.[5] In summary, the Ugandan government is offering six months of non-formal TVET to refugees, in classes that are formed of 70% refugees and 30% people from the nearby community. At the end of this TVET, they are assessed and certified, allowing them to progress within Uganda's educational system if they decide to do so. This also makes sense in the context of Uganda's progressive refugee policy, which aims to find long-term solutions for settling refugees rather than relying on repatriation.

---

4 "Refugees are migrants who have crossed an international frontier because of conflict, violence, or a well-founded fear of persecution, being unwilling or unable to return to their country of origin based on threat due to their race, religion, political views, or social status." (⇡UNHCR, 1967).

5 ⇡DIT Uganda, Skills Training & Certification for Refugees in Uganda (2018), *available at* https://youtu.be/CXzqBDy9dFE

9.4. Chapter bibliography

This bibliography can be accessed from the ⇡entry for this document in our evidence library.

Abay, N. A. (2016). *From counting women to ensuring women count: A qualitative study of university and early career experiences of women secondary school teachers in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia from a capabilities perspective.* (⇡record)

Achandi, E. L., Mujawamariya, G., Agboh-Noameshie, A. R., Gebremariam, S., Rahalivav-ololona, N., Rodenburg, J., Rahalivavololona, N., Rodenburg, J., & Rodenburg, J. (2018). Women's access to agricultural technologies in rice production and processing hubs: A comparative analysis of Ethiopia, Madagascar and Tanzania. *Journal of Rural Studies.* https://doi.org/10/gf62jz (⇡record)

African Union. (2007). *Strategy to revitalize technical and vocational education and training (TVET) in Africa.* http://www.academia.edu/download/45693684/TVET.pdf (⇡record)

Alade, I. A. (2015). Effects of Three Categories of Manpower on Undergraduate Students' Learning Outcomes in Technical Education and Their Implications for the Curriculum Implementation. *JISTE, 19*(2). (⇡record)

Asare, R., Akuffobea, M., Quaye, W., & Atta-Antwi, K. (2015). Characteristics of micro, small and medium enterprises in Ghana: Gender and implications for economic growth. *African Journal of Science, Technology, Innovation and Development.* https://doi.org/10/gd9bc3 (⇡record)

BMBF. (n.d.). *Genderforschung.* Bundesministerium für Bildung und Forschung - BMBF. Retrieved May 28, 2020, from https://www.bmbf.de/de/genderforschung-222.html (⇡record)

Bennell, P., Mukyanuzi, F., Kasogela, M., Mutashubirwa, F., & Klim, M. (2006). Artisan training and employment outcomes in Tanzania. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education.* https://doi.org/10/cq4xfd (⇡record)

Colley, K. E. (2014). Teacher education in anglophone west Africa: Does policy match practice? *International Perspectives on Education and Society.* https://doi.org/10/gf62j3 (⇡record)

DIT Uganda. (2018). *Skills Training & Certification for Refugees in Uganda.* https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CXzqBDy9dFE&feature=youtu.be (⇡record)

FAWE - Forum for African Women Educationalists. (n.d.). Forum for African Women Educationalists: FAWE. Retrieved January 15, 2019, from http://fawe.org/home/ (⇡record)

Galukande, M., Maling, S., Kabakyenga, J., Nshaho, J., Oboke, H., Oonge, B., Muyenje, H., Katumba-Sentongo, G., Mayanja-Kizza, H., & Sewankambo, N. K. (2018). Equitable

access to health professional training in Uganda: A cross sectional study. *Annals of Global Health*. https://doi.org/10/gd4gt8 (⇧record)

Gender Strategy for the Education and Training Sector, (2014) (testimony of Government of Ethiopia). http://www.moe.gov.et/documents/20182/36315/GENDER+STRATEGY.pdf/b9e68a15-bc9e-4930-a5d2-1c1981ca264c (⇧record)

Government of Botswana. (1997). *National Policy on Vocational Education and Training*. (⇧record)

Government of Botswana. (2010). *Revised National Youth Policy*. (⇧record)

Government of Botswana. (2015). *ETSSP 2015-2020 - Education & Training Sector Strategic Plan*. (⇧record)

Government of Ethiopia. (2014). *Gender Responsive Pedagogy Manual*. http://www.moe.gov.et/documents/20182/36315/Gender+Responsive+Pedagogy+Manual+%28Autosaved%29%281%29.pdf/56f75fcb-7a0b-4c7f-8cf0-02468495cd80 (⇧record)

Government of Kenya. (2013). *TVET Act, n°29 of 2013 - Technical and Vocational Education and Training Act (Kenya) - L.N. 95/2013, L.N. 57/2014*. https://www.ilo.org/dyn/natlex/docs/ELECTRONIC/98807/117649/F1763223240/KEN98807.pdf (⇧record)

Government of Kenya. (2018). *TVET Strategic Plan 2018-2022*. http://www.tvetauthority.go.ke/wp-content/uploads/2018/06/TIVETA-STRATEGIC-PLAN-2-e-pub_2-Compressed.pdf (⇧record)

Government of Nigeria. (1985). *Education Act N° 16 (National Minimum Standards and Establishment of Institutions)*. (⇧record)

Government of Uganda. (2014). *UBTEB rules on the assessment of competences and conduct of business, technical and vocational examinations in Uganda*. http://ubteb.go.ug/sites/default/files/Rules%20of%20UBTEB%20Examinations%20Rules%20and%20Regulations.pdf (⇧record)

Government of Uganda. (2016). *Gender in Education Policy*. https://www.education.go.ug/files/downloads/GENDER%20IN%20EDUCATION%20SECTOR%20POLICY.pdf (⇧record)

Hobler, D., Lott, Y., Pfahl, S., & Buschoff, K. (2020). *Stand der Gleichstellung von Frauen und Männern in Deutschland* (WSI Report No. 56). (⇧record)

Kleefeldt, E. (2018). *Resilienz, Empowerment und Selbstorganisation geflüchteter Menschen*. Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht. (⇧record)

Maina, L. (2016). *Enhancing access to education and training for persons with disabilities in Somalia and Somaliland*. http://www.eenet.org.uk/resources/eenet_newsletter/eer5/page26.php (⇧record)

Malle, A. Y. (2016). Inclusiveness in the Vocational Education Policy and Legal Frame-works of Kenya and Tanzania. *Journal of Education and Learning*. (⇡record)

Masinire, A. (2015). Teachers' Perceptions and Students' Lived Experiences in Vocational-Technical Subjects in a Rural High School in Zimbabwe. *Gender and Education*. https://doi.org/10/gf62kx (⇡record)

Mulder, M., & Roelofs, E. (2012). *A Critical Review of Vocational Education and Training Research in 2012 and Suggestions for the Research Agenda*. https://www.mmulder.nl/wp-content/uploads/2011/11/2013-Mulder-Roelofs-Critical-Review-of-VET-Re-search-and-Research-Agenda-2012.pdf (⇡record)

Murthy, C. S. H. N. (2006). Designing the Course and Curricula for Teacher Development, Open School and Vocational Education through Media Education in Eritrea. *Educational Media International*. https://doi.org/10/c8nzvz (⇡record)

Muya, M., Price, A. D. f., & Edum-Fotwe, F. T. (2006). Construction craft skills requirements in sub-Saharan Africa: A focus on Zambia. *Engineering, Construction and Architectural Management*. https://doi.org/10/bzvww9 (⇡record)

NEPAD. (2013). *Review of agricultural technical vocational education and training (ATVET) in Africa : best practices from Benin, Ethiopia, Namibia and Sierra Leone*. (⇡record)

Nganyi, J., Odebero, S., Onderi, H., & Musera, G. (2014). Strategies That Enhance Students Access to Public Technical Training Institutions in Kenya. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*. http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.679.8830&rep=rep1&type=pdf (⇡record)

Romiszowski, A. (2015). *Baseline Study for Distance Technical and Professional Education in Mozambique*. http://oasis.col.org/handle/11599/1775 (⇡record)

Safford, K., Cooper, D., Wolfenden, F., & Chitsulo, J. (2013). "Give courage to the ladies": Expansive apprenticeship for women in rural Malawi. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*. https://doi.org/10/gf62pr (⇡record)

Sonnenberg, K. (2012). Traditional apprenticeship in Ghana and Senegal: Skills development for youth for the informal sector. *Journal of International Cooperation in Education*. http://home.hiroshima-u.ac.jp/~cice/wp-content/uploads/publications/15-2/15-2-06.pdf (⇡record)

UNESCO. (2018). *Situational analysis on the status of sexual and reproductive health of students and gender-based violence in technical and vocational colleges in Malawi* (No. 2). UNESCO. https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000261725 (⇡record)

UNHCR. (1967). *Convention and Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees*. https://www.unhcr.org/protection/basic/3b66c2aa10/convention-protocol-relating-status-ref-ugees.html (⇡record)

Vandenbosch, T. (2006). *Post-primary agricultural education and training in sub-Saharan Africa: Adapting supply to changing demand.* http://www.academia.edu/download/6744911/post-primary_aet_africa.pdf (⇡record)

Wonder, M., & Tenson, M. (2017). The Informal Apprenticeship Miracle: A Case for Mbare-Magaba Informal Industry, Zimbabwe. *Eastern Africa Social Science Research Review.* https://doi.org/10/gf62z9 (⇡record)